### Evaluation Criteria for Design-Build Services

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contract #</th>
<th>Contractor:</th>
<th>Actual Evaluation Date:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Constructor:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Designer of Record:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scheduled Evaluation Date:</td>
<td></td>
<td>Actual Evaluation Date:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contract Description:</td>
<td></td>
<td>Firm Fed ID#:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agency:</td>
<td></td>
<td>Contract Amount:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluator:</td>
<td></td>
<td>Interim:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reviewer:</td>
<td></td>
<td>Summary:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approver</td>
<td></td>
<td>Data Entry Person (if applicable):</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Evaluation:

- **S** = Satisfactory
- **M** = Marginal
- **U** = Unsatisfactory
- **NA** = Not Applicable

### MWDBE Goals Compliance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overall Goals Compliance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ENTER / VIEW MWDBE RATING</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unable to Rate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Safety, Security, Protection, and Operations Impact

1. Safety Requirements
2. Protection and Security
3. Safety Plan
4. Operations Impact
5. Site Maintenance
6. Noted Safety Deficiencies
7. Overall Safety, Security, Protection, and Operations Impact

### Quality

8. Adherence to Scope
9. Technical Competence
10. Codes and Standards
11. Health, Safety, and Environmental Sustainability
12. RFIs
13. Non-conformances and Deviations
## Evaluation Criteria for Design-Build Services

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evaluation Criteria</th>
<th>S = Satisfactory</th>
<th>M = Marginal</th>
<th>U = Unsatisfactory</th>
<th>NA = Not Applicable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14. Drawings</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Adequacy of Design Staffing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Materials and Equipment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Workmanship</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Training</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Submittals and Deliverables</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Testing and Commissioning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Quality Assurance Program</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Noted Quality Deficiencies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Overall Quality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Scheduling and Schedule Adherence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evaluation Criteria</th>
<th>S = Satisfactory</th>
<th>M = Marginal</th>
<th>U = Unsatisfactory</th>
<th>NA = Not Applicable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>24. Scheduling</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. Schedule Adherence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. Adequacy of Constructor Staffing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. Availability of Materials and Equipment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28. Subcontractor/Supplier Selection</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29. Contract Milestones</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Evaluation Criteria for Design-Build Services

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contract #:</th>
<th>Contractor:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Constructor:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Designer of Record:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scheduled Evaluation Date:</th>
<th>Actual Evaluation Date:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contract Description:</th>
<th>Firm Fed ID:#:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency:</th>
<th>Contract Amount:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evaluator:</th>
<th>Interim:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reviewer:</th>
<th>Data Entry Person (if applicable):</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Approver</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evaluation:</th>
<th>S = Satisfactory</th>
<th>M = Marginal</th>
<th>U = Unsatisfactory</th>
<th>NA = Not Applicable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

#### 30. Overall Scheduling and Schedule Adherence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Management</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

#### 31. Agency Directives

#### 32. Change Orders

#### 33. Use of Agency Resources

#### 34. Subcontractors and Suppliers

#### 35. Punchlist Work

#### 36. Prompt Payment Requirements

#### 37. MWDBE Compliance Documentation

#### 38. Design-Build Management Team

#### 39. Overall Management

#### 40. Overall Performance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Approvals:</th>
<th>Evaluator</th>
<th>Reviewer</th>
<th>Approver</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
**All-Agency Contractor Evaluation System**

**Explanation of Evaluation Criteria**

**DESIGN – BUILD SERVICES**

**MWDBE GOALS COMPLIANCE CATEGORY**

**Overall Goals Compliance**

This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to MWDBE goals.

- Compare the latest approved utilization plan (Federal Form A, or New York State Form 15A.1) against the Design-Builder’s monthly utilization plan update (Federal Form E, or New York State Form 15A.3) and the updated contract schedule. Together, do these documents show that the Design-Builder is compliant with the required MWDBE goals?

- While the agency will perform all interim evaluations, the Department of Diversity and Civil Rights will provide the Summary Evaluation for this category.

**SAFETY, SECURITY, PROTECTION, AND OPERATIONS IMPACT CATEGORY**

1. **Safety Requirements**

This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the Contract with respect to safety requirements.

- Did the Design-Builder comply with Federal, State and/or local laws and regulatory provisions?

2. **Protection and Security**

This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to protection and security of the job site and those working there.

- Did the Design-Builder establish and maintain adequate measures to ensure the protection of persons and property from hazardous conditions? This might include items such as perimeter fencing, security guards, barricades, lighting, identification badges, use of personal protection equipment, etc.

- Did the Design-Builder establish and maintain adequate measures to ensure the safe handling and movement of equipment and materials.

3. **Safety Plan**

This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to the Design-Builder’s development and implementation of a Safety Plan.

- This might include accident prevention programs, fire prevention/protection plans, confined space entry, requirements for employee use of personal protective equipment, etc.
DESIGN – BUILD SERVICES

- Was appropriate instruction/training on accident prevention/safety management given to all applicable employees?
- In the event of accidents and injuries, were they thoroughly investigated and reported and were corrective measures, policies and practices promptly put into place?

4. Operations Impact
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to the Design-Builder’s effect on the agency’s normal operations.
- Did the Design-Builder stay within contractually permissible Agency operations impacts?
- Was the Design-Builder successful at carrying out the work while avoiding unplanned disruption of Agency operations?

5. Site Maintenance
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the contract’s requirements for general housekeeping at the project work site. This may include the storage of hazardous materials, physical hazards impacting site access, etc.
- What was the general level of cleanliness and order kept at the site?
- Are there tripping hazards, improper storage of materials and/or equipment, or other physical hazards impacting the site?

6. Noted Safety Deficiencies
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to the correction of safety deficiencies called to the Design-Builder’s attention.
- Was the Design-Builder response to any noted deficiency prompt and sufficient to correct the problem?

7. Overall Safety, Security, Protection, and Operations Impact
Summarize the Design-Builder’s component evaluations of items 1 through 6 above.

QUALITY CATEGORY

8. Adherence to Scope
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the Contract with respect to how closely the Consultant is following the Contract’s Scope of Work.
DESIGN – BUILD SERVICES

- Did the Design-Builder address the various technical aspects of the scope (including estimated cost of construction)?
- Did the Design-Builder adequately address the needs of the agency in terms of the program for the space?
- Did the Design-Builder adhere to the specific requirements of the Scope of Work?
- Evaluate the extent to which the Design-Builder was responsive to agency comments and suggestions with respect to the project design.

9. Technical Competence
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the Contract with respect to how well the design team performed to provide a complete and proper design product that is conflict-free and error-free.
- Does the design exhibit good engineering practices as well as proper internal coordination among disciplines?
- Does the design generally exhibit a high level of technical ability on the part of the Design-Builder?
- As appropriate, were alternative solutions developed during preliminary engineering?
- Does the design exhibit particularly innovative and/or creative approaches to resolving design issues?
- Does the design address the maintainability of the facility?

10. Codes and Standards
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to codes and standards.
- Did the designer incorporate the applicable codes?
- Did the Designer incorporate the appropriate standards in the design?

11. Health, Safety, and Environmental Sustainability
This component evaluates the extent to which the design considers the health and safety of the people who will work at or use the facility, as well as how well the design addresses required environmental sustainability standards.

12. RFI's
This component evaluates the quality & timeliness of the Design-Builder's responses to requests for information as well as preparation of amplifying drawings.

13. Non-conformances and Deviations
DESIGN – BUILD SERVICES

This component evaluates the quality and timeliness of the Design-Builder’s evaluation and recommended resolution of the Design-Builder’s non-conformances and deviations.

- Did the Design-Builder utilize innovative or creative approaches to resolve such issues?

14. Drawings
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to all Design-Builder-generated drawings and sketches.

- Evaluate the clarity, thoroughness and accuracy of record drawings, shop drawings and as-built drawings.
- Were drawing submissions timely and properly coordinated across disciplines?
- This item may include preparation and maintenance of working drawings, record drawings (as-builts), and shop drawings during performance of the work.

15. Adequacy of Design Staffing
This component assesses the Design-Builder’s qualifications and staffing level during the design process.

- Assess the adequacy, availability and appropriateness, both in terms of numbers and qualifications, of Design-Builder and subconsultant staff involved in the project. Consider staff leadership and level of senior management participation as well.
- Was the planned level of staffing appropriate to meet budget and schedule requirements?
- Did the Design-Builder spend an unreasonable percentage of the contract amount relative to the progress achieved?

16. Materials and Equipment
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to materials and equipment.

- Are the products as per specifications and/or industry standards?
- Do laboratory tests and quality inspections confirm material reliability?
- Is there an effectively implemented system for verification of compliance of all materials/equipment with receipt, handling, storage and/or preservation guidelines?

17. Workmanship
DESIGN – BUILD SERVICES

This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to form, fit and finish.

- Was the workmanship in conformance with contract specifications and industry standards?
- Did the agency need to identify deficiencies due to poor workmanship?

18. Training
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to training of agency personnel.

- Was the training adequate and timely?
- Were complete and adequate training materials provided?

19. Submittals and Deliverables
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to submittals and deliverables (other than drawings; see item #14 above).

- Evaluate the clarity, thoroughness and accuracy of submittals and deliverables.
- Were submittals and deliverables submitted timely?

20. Testing and Commissioning
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to all testing and commissioning.

- Evaluate whether material, equipment, component, system and product testing requirements were followed.
- Evaluate whether systems/facility commissioning requirements were followed.
- Were inspection and test plans developed and implemented?
- Were approved laboratory and inspection standards utilized?

21. Quality Assurance Program
This component assesses if the design-build process was managed in accordance with the Design-Builder's QA Program, as well as the Agency’s procedures? Also, it evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to quality assurance.

- Was the approved Quality Assurance Program implemented?
- Did the Design-Builder schedule and perform required internal quality audits?

22. Noted Quality Deficiencies
DESIGN – BUILD SERVICES

This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with respect to the correction of quality deficiencies called to the Contractor’s attention.

• Was the Design-Builder response to any noted deficiency prompt and sufficient to correct the problem?
• Were deficiencies analyzed for root cause to prevent recurrence?

23. Overall Quality
Summarize the Design-Builder’s component evaluations of items 8 through 22 above.

SCHEDULING AND SCHEDULE ADHERENCE CATEGORY

24. Scheduling
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to establishing, and maintaining/updating a reasonable, contract schedule.

• Evaluate the timeliness of schedule submission and evaluate the schedule for conformance with contract requirements.
• Is the schedule sufficiently detailed?
• If required, is the schedule cost- and/or resource-loaded?
• Is there an adequate number of properly qualified schedulers?

25. Schedule Adherence
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to following the established schedule.

• Evaluate the degree to which the Design-Builder adhered to the approved project schedule.
• Following the established schedule might include: keeping to the sequence as scheduled, including the activity start dates, etc.

26. Adequacy of Constructor Staffing
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to personnel used to perform the work in the field.

• Was the workforce appropriate to meet the needs of the contract schedule?

27. Availability of Materials and Equipment
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with terms of the contract with respect to availability of materials and equipment to meet the contract schedule.

• Did delays or disruption to the project schedule result from a shortage of the right materials on site at a given time?
DESIGN – BUILD SERVICES

28. Subcontractor/Supplier Selection
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to the timely submission and approval of subcontractors and suppliers.
- Did the Design-Builder collect and review pre- and post-award vendor information as well as evaluate the subcontractor/supplier to ensure the selection of a responsible vendor?

29. Contract Milestones
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s achievement of contract milestones.
- Evaluate whether the Design-Builder completed work within contract milestones or were there schedule slippages not related to Agency-caused delays?

30. Overall Scheduling and Schedule Adherence
Summarize the Design-Builder’s component evaluations of 24 through 29.

MANAGEMENT CATEGORY

31. Agency Directives
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s timely and effective compliance with Agency directives/orders.
- Was repeated correspondence (written or oral) required for a directive to be carried out or were orders acted upon expeditiously?

32. Change Orders / Additional Work Orders (AWOs, term applies to NYCTA contracts)
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with processing the paperwork for Change Orders / AWOs.
- Evaluate the extent to which additional work order (AWO)/change order (CO) requests and/or proposals were submitted within the contractual time frame and, once submitted, were they complete and accurate or were additional submissions required to process the Change Order / AWO?

33. Use of Agency Resources
This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to the use of Agency resources.
- Evaluate the Design-Builder’s effectiveness in utilizing Agency support personnel, services and other resources, such as in-house account personnel, flagmen, track/lane outages, maintenance and protection of traffic (MPT) and Agency equipment.
DESIGN – BUILD SERVICES

- Were General Orders (GOs)/track/lane outages, MPT, etc. utilized to their fullest? Were Gos/track/lane outage requests MPT, etc submitted in a complete and timely fashion?

34. **Subcontractors and Suppliers**
   This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s management and supervision of its subcontractors and suppliers.
   - Did the Design-Builder ensure that its subcontractors/suppliers, provide goods and services in compliance with contractual requirements (e.g., perform oversight, inspections, independent testing, etc.)?
   - Did the Design-Builder direct subcontractors/suppliers to take necessary corrective action?
   - Was work among subs/suppliers properly coordinated and sequenced or were there frequent scheduling and access difficulties among subs/suppliers?

35. **Punchlist Work**
   This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with requirements to complete punchlist/remaining contract work.
   - Evaluate the timeliness and quality with which punchlist work was performed.

36. **Prompt Payment Requirements**
   This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to submission of payment requisition packages to the agency and subsequent disbursements to subcontractors and suppliers.
   - Has the agency received timely and complete payment request packages from the Design-Builder?

37. **MWDBE Compliance Documentation**
   This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the terms of the contract with respect to the timely, complete, and accurate submission of MWDBE compliance documentation. This may include New York State Form 15A.3, Federal Form E, waiver requests, and any other DDCR required documentation.

38. **Design-Build Management Team**
   This component evaluates the Design-Builder’s compliance with the contract’s requirements regarding the qualifications and effectiveness of the Design-Builder’s management personnel, including back-office operations.
   - Were the responsibilities and level of authority of each individual clear and appropriate?
DESIGN – BUILD SERVICES

- Was there timely and effective follow-up on issues in response to agency directives?
- Was there effective management of the skilled work force (e.g., tradesmen, engineers, etc.)

39. Overall Management
Summarize the Design-Builder’s component evaluations of 31 through 38.

40. OVERALL PERFORMANCE
Consider all of the characteristics rated in the key indicators of performance, i.e., MWDBE Goals Compliance Category and items 7, 23, 30, and 39:

- The Overall Performance rating cannot be better than the rating for the Quality category.
- Two or more category ratings of less-than-satisfactory (Marginal or Unsatisfactory) must result in an Overall less-than-satisfactory (Unsatisfactory or Marginal) rating.
- Two or more category ratings of Unsatisfactory must result in an Overall Unsatisfactory rating.

- end -